<p style="color:crimson; text-align:center">Minutes of the 91st meeting of
The Advisory Committee for Wales
Hybrid meeting on 28 November 2023</p>

Present

Robert Andrews	Chair
Angharad Evans	Member
Aled Eirug	Member (items 1-9)

In attendance

Eleanor Marks	Director, Ofcom Wales
Elinor Williams	Regulatory Affairs Principal, Wales, Ofcom
Meleri Evans	Regulatory Affairs Manager, Wales, Ofcom
David Jones	Ofcom Board Member for Wales
Ruth McElroy	Content Board Member for Wales
Rick Hill	Chairman, Communications Consumer Panel

Other Ofcom colleagues

Apologies

Tom Crick	Member

Agenda items	Action
1. Introduction The Chairman welcomed attendees to the 91st meeting of the Advisory Committee for Wales. Apologies were received from Tom Crick as he had recently indicated he would tender his resignation due to a conflict of interest with a new role. Aled Eirug gave apologies for items 10-13.	
2. Declaration of Members' Interests – verbal None.	
3. Minutes of the meeting held on 13 June 2023 and matters arising The minutes were APPROVED, with the addition of comments received from the Chair.	
4. **Chairman's Report – verbal** The Chair gave a verbal update of activities since the last meeting including the outcome of the Ways of Working discussion which included: • Welsh simultaneous translation will be made available at all meetings. • Confirmation of the Committee's remit is to shape and identify advice to Ofcom in a clear and precise manner.	

Agenda items	Action
- In response to members' complaints of too many Ofcom emails, it was suggested that Members could opt out of Ofcom updates and alerts to lessen email traffic. Members are encouraged to set up alert to private email accounts when an Ofcom email is received. - The advertisement for new members will now include a search for three new members following Tom Crick's resignation. Members are encouraged to highlight vacancies via their networks. The Content Board is also recruiting new members. - Ofcom Wales to investigate other avenues to advertise bilingually with Communications colleagues. EM to liaise with recruitment agency. - The Chair and Ofcom Wales to suggest presenters at next year's meetings noting it would be helpful to have greater insight to online. The Chair agreed to circulate a collaborative document to garner suggestions. Members to populate.	ACW Ofcom Wales ACW/ Ofcom Wales
5. Update: Ofcom Board Member for Wales The Board Member for Wales updated Members on the Board's Annual Strategy day held in August. He said that they had discussed two broad themes. The first was the advent of AI and the opportunites and risks that accompany it. Members dicussed the impact of AI on Welsh language translations. The second theme was geo-politics in a UK context with a focus on: types of innovation and technology; economic development impacts; cyber security; and governance and the role of regulators. There was a discussion on how AI might assist with Welsh translation – Ofcom is looking into options. He suggested that a representative of Bangor University could address a future ACW meeting to discuss the merits of AI within the role of language. EW commented that from personal use she had been very impressed with its translation capabilities. Ofcom will investigate the benefits. KEY ADVICE Ofcom should explore leveraging the use of machine translation.	Ofcom Wales
6. Update - Communications Consumer Panel Member for Wales The Chair of the Communications Consumer Panel and Member for Northern Ireland Member had submitted a paper in advance and drew attention to the following issues: - The Panel is waiting for the Government to conclude the process of recruiting a member for Wales. A recruitment campaign for a replacement Chair is also running. - On migration of VoIP research continues on how best to communicate to affected consumers. The pan UK campaign is still being left to the communications providers. It was suggested that the Committee invite someone from BT to address the Committee in relation to VoIP. - There is ongoing concern around access to reliable postal services and proposed reduced delivery days especially in rural areas. - RH to report back to the Committee to confirm if the Panel has been working with Welsh Government in relation to the minimum digital standard of living. - The Panel has been doing some work around online safety and the use of personal data. It is keen to get people on the Panel with online skills to look at different types of content. There is a plan to carry out research into digital privacy and ethics following on from a piece of work commissioned previously.	Ofcom Wales Rick Hill

Agenda items	Action
<u>KEY ADVICE</u> PSTN research can now/soon begin accounting for post-migration consumer behaviour/sentiment, not just prior, to provide real experiences of migration.	
7. Update: Content Board Member for Wales The Content Board Member for Wales had previously circulated an update report which was taken as read. In addition she highlighted the following points: - The Chair of the Content Board's term finishes at the end of January. - The Board is currently assessing what topics it wants to raise. One of which is the news landscape in the nations and regions. - She commented that the agenda currently does not include a specific item for matters in the nations and regions. The Board's remit is so expansive. The Member for Wales plans to discuss how this can be improved with the incoming Chair. She felt the Board needs new membership to ensure inclusion and clarity of voices from each of the nations. - There was a discussion around online safety and the volume of work expected by the Content Board. The Board plans to formulate a strategy. It was suggested that there may be a need for a communications strategy to address any misunderstanding of Ofcom's remit.	
8. Update: Public Policy An update paper had been circulated to members. Kate Biggs joined the meeting and highlighted a number of Parliamentary developments and policy areas including. - The Media Bill is proceeding at pace, the implementation of the Online Bill and preparation for the forthcoming General Election. - In answer to a question regarding S4C , KB advised that the currently situation is being monitored by Ofcom Wales staff but this was not a matter for Ofcom. - There was a discussion around the ongoing USO consultation. Members discussed the proposed process of how to encourage stakeholders in Wales to participate. Ofcom Wales has been working with the London team and looking for opportunities to arrange 121s with stakeholders. It was suggested there should also be an ongoing discussion on the possibility of arranging wider roundtable events in the future. KB to advise members if there is currently an engagement plan in place.	 KB
9. Report: Wales Recent Developments Eleanor Marks, Director Wales, highlighted the following from her written report that had been circulated to members ahead of the meeting: - Ofcom Wales hosted the Ofcom Board out of London meeting in November and she thanked the team for arranging a successful event. - Update on recruitment. Ofcom Wales is currently recruiting for a Senior Welsh Language Advisor and three ACW members. There is still a vacancy for an online Associate which will be advertised in the new year. - EM confirmed that Ofcom had approved the proposals to changes at BBC Cymru 2.	

Agenda items	Action
• She gave an update on the large volume of current Welsh language work. Ofcom Wales is still waiting to here back from the Welsh Language commissioner regarding a requested variation to the Standards around social media. • Members discussed points raised in the Welsh Affairs Committee report on Broadcasting in Wales. This included the Committee's view on supporting listed events in Wales. It was suggested the Committee formulated a response to its proposals and that it discussed this further at a later stage. KEY ADVICE Re: BBC Radio Cymru 2 – ACW concurred with the balanced assessment of the decision.	ACW
10. Channel 4 Briony Robinson, Sam Westbrook (in person) and the Head of Sport (via Teams) joined the meeting and gave a presentation on Channel 4's current, recent and future activities. The team outlined the Channel's future plans including coverage of the Paralympics. Members were delighted to here about plans to convert the Tramshed into a production base/studio for the Paralympics coverage and future sporting events such as Formular One. The Chair thanked the team for their time and presentation. SW to circulate slides.	C4
11. Channel 4 relicensing This item is to be rescheduled at a future meeting.	
12. Future of TV distribution The Call for Evidence paper was discussed. The Committee noted the closing date for responses was 12 December. The Chair had not received any comments or responses to questions asked in the document from members to date. The Questions asked were discussed but due to a low number of members present at the meeting it was agreed that he would draft a skeleton response and circulate to members for input as time was tight. Ofcom expressed the importance of the ACW responding. EW to enquire if a deadline extension was possible.	Ofcom Wales
13. Illegal Harms consultation Laura Nettleton and Rachael Krishna gave a presentation to the Committee. There was a discussion on Welsh language requirements. Members asked what conversations had taken place with platforms around language. How would an offensive comment in Welsh be dealt with? The team advised they were looking into this area and would feed back to the Committee on the process of handling such material. KEY ADVICE Re Online safety: because Ofcom's framework will allow platforms to use machine identification of harmful content in the first instance, it is important that Ofcom ensures the platforms can best identify harmful content in the Welsh language. This should include providing, to platforms, lists of automated translation services.	LN
14. Information items (noted)	

Agenda items	
	Action
Key items to note from today's meeting: • Board Member item: Ofcom to explore leverage in using AI for translation • CCP: the Committee suggested to the Panel that its research might like to take into account post migration sentiment. The Panel to look into improving communications around migration. ACW to support and strengthen CCP's concerns from consumers post migration. • Public Policy: the Committee conveyed the importance of considering AI to assist with Welsh translation. No additional agenda items proposed. **Future meeting dates:** The Committee raised concern that the October and November meetings in 2024 were very close together and requested Ofcom Wales looked into possibly changing the dates.	Ofcom Wales CCP Ofcom Wales

_____   **Date**: _____

          Chair

[remove for published minutes]